



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 24, 2005

Ms. Luz E. Sandoval Walker
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
2 Civic Center Plaza - 9th Floor
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2005-00673

Dear Ms. Walker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 217565.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for "all police reports on file" relating to a named individual. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). When a law enforcement agency is asked to compile a particular individual's criminal history information, the compiled information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right to privacy in a manner that the same information in an uncompiled state does not. *See U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 616 at 2-3 (1993). Moreover, the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* found that information protected by common-law privacy includes information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683

In the present request, the requestor asks for all police records regarding a named individual. We determine that the request implicates the individual's right to privacy. We have marked information in a submitted document that falls within the categories of private information identified in *Industrial Foundation* and must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101. *Id.* Furthermore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the individual at issue as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy pursuant to the decision in *Reporters Committee*.

Next, section 552.101 also encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Section 58.007(c) of the Family Code provides in pertinent part as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). A portion of the submitted information involves juvenile conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Thus, we find that the information we have marked is confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld under section 552.101.

We note the submitted documents contain the social security number of a member of the public. A social security number may be excepted from disclosure in some circumstances under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I) of title 42 of the United States Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994)*. These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security number at issue is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public

disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Finally, you have marked information in a portion of the submitted records that you seek to withhold under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides in pertinent part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130. The department must withhold the marked motor vehicle information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the individual at issue as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We have marked some information in the submitted records that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We have marked information that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. A social security number may be excepted under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law. The marked motor vehicle information must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remainder of the submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within thirty calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within ten calendar days.

Id. § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within ten calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within ten calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within ten calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



David R. Saldivar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DRS/seg

Ref: ID# 217565

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Donna Crafton
Scott, Hulse, Marshall, Feuille, Finger & Thurmond, P.C.
P.O. Box 99123
El Paso, Texas 79999-9123
(w/o enclosures)